### Effectiveness of stormwater management practices in protecting stream channel stability

- 2: Stormwater Management Assessment, under Theme A: Effectiveness of Restoration Programs at the Watershed Scale
- 4: Climate Change Impacts to Restoration Practices



### Project partners and contributors

- **Tess Wynn Thompson**, Associate Professor, Biological Systems Engineering, Virginia Tech
- **David Sample**, Professor and Extension Specialist Biological Systems Engineering, Virginia Tech
- Mohammad Al-Smadi, Senior Water Resources Engineer, Stantec
- Sami Towsif Khan, PhD Candidate, Biological Systems Engineering, Virginia Tech
- Mina Shahed Behrouz, Water Resources Designer, Stantec
- **Andrew Miller**, Professor, Geography and Environmental Systems, University of Maryland, Baltimore County

Jon Butcher, Professional Hydrologist, TetraTech



#### How can we develop land and protect streams?

1. Does environmental site design (ESD) protect channel stability under current and future climate?

While ESD provides environmental benefits, it does not protect channel stability.

2. How can we "tweak" ESD to protect channel stability?





#### In this talk, "sediment" is not a fourlettered word.



- Coarse sediment is naturally transported in suspension and along the channel bed.
- Fine sediment does not play a major role in channel morphology.



## In this talk, stream "stability" means the channel is not becoming deeper and/or wider



The X-yr storm event does not produce the X-yr flood,

where X = 1, 2, 10, 100...



2-yr RI flood



#### All models are wrong, but some are useful

- George Box, British statistician







Apply common sense.



http://www.clipartpanda.com/clipart\_ images/reality-check-ahead-59860852 http://www.clipartpanda.com/clipart\_images/ reality-check-ahead-59860852

## Ok, let's talk research...



Tributary 109 to Little Seneca Creek served as a case study

- 0.3 mi<sup>2</sup> drainage area, 44% TIA
- Developed 2006 2016
- USGS stream gage (2004)
- USGS rain gage
- Montgomery County data
  - Cross sections
  - Longitudinal profiles
  - Pebble counts
- Multiple lidar datasets





Stormwater system was designed to meet the 2008 ESD requirements:

#### 5 ponds

- 26 micro bioretention (MBR)
- 10 infiltration trenches (IT)
- 11 sand filters (SF)
- 18 underground storage facilities (UGS)

"Distributed" stormwater control practices





### Results...



## Both ponds (storage) and distributed SCMs are needed to minimize hydrologic impacts of development



Percent Change in Flow Peak and Volume from

#### In the future, due to climate change...

- Precipitation will generally occur more frequently.
  - Example: the 50th percentile of *time between storms* will decrease from 3 to 2 days.
- However, when there are droughts (time between storms >5 days), they will last longer.
- Change in maximum flow (over 59 years) ranges from a decrease of 18% to an increase of 117% over current conditions.





# What does the change in hydrology mean for channel stability?









#### Where do we go from here?

To protect channel stability, we need to consider sediment transport in the receiving stream.

- 1. Maintain pre-development erosion potential (Washington State)
  - Total mass sediment transported for a given duration

Pre-development = Post-development



for continuous simulation

- for design storms
- 2. Maintain pre-development excess shear stress (Santa Clara, CA)
  - Total "excess shear stress" for a given duration

$$(\tau - \tau_c)$$

#### https://www.vhv.rs/

Hawley, Robert J., Kathryn Russell, and Kristine Taniguchi-Quan. 2022. "Restoring Geomorphic Integrity in Urban Streams via Mechanistically-Based Storm Water Management: Minimizing Excess Sediment Transport Capacity." Urban Ecosystems 25 (4): 1247–64. https://doi.org/10.1007/s11252-022-01221-y.







### Summary

- Design storms do not translate directly to watershed response.
- Infiltration practices reduce annual runoff, but do little to reduce peak flows.
- Stormwater storage (ponds) is needed to manage high flows.
- Environmental site design is an improvement over conventional stormwater management, but will not protect channel stability.
- Climate change will exacerbate existing deficiencies in ESD.
- To protect channel stability, stormwater management needs to be designed to meet sediment transport targets.
- Erosion potential shows the most promise for protecting channel stability.
- Continuing this work with Minebank Run case study



#### Recommendations



Parade.com

## Software with Maryland-specific climate data could be developed

Weather Station Data - GSOD (NOAA)	2 ×	
🛉 Create New Station	🔀 Export 🗐 Close	THEORY PERSON
Search Filter by Code by Location 138 Drag a column header here to group by that column	General     Dry/Normal/Wet Years     Influence Area     Data Management     Help       Station Code - Site Code (WM0 ID)     20334-WB     30     20334-WB       V/RAN ID Mumbra     COOR ID     Coll Sime	
Code WBAN Location State 720334-WB 93764 GAITHERSBURG MONTGOMER' MD	93764	set Site and/or Weather Station(s) on Google
720397-WB 00131 OHIO STATE UNIVERSITY SNYD OH 722020-WB 12839 MIAMI INTERNATIONAL AIRPOR FL 722030-WB 12844 WEST PALM BEACH INTLARPT FL	Latitude         Longitude         Elevation (it)           39.1700         -77.1700         539.04	
722045-WB 12843 VERO BEACH MUNI FL 722050-WB 12815 ORLANDO INTERNATIONAL AIR FL	MD State Show Station Data Summary	Current Units Current Project None 03.00.003 CAUsers'thwynn\Documents\MyWetbud\Wetbud2FD8 Statellite
722056-WB 12834 DAYTONA BEACH INTL FL 722060-WB 13889 JACKSONVILLE INTERNATIONA FL 722070-WB 03822 SAVANNAH/HILTON HEAD INTL GA	Pre-loaded Station     30     Station     Coart     Chart Annual Precipitation	Gettysburg Greencastle To Waynesboro To Waynesboro To Waynesboro To Waynesboro
722080-WB 13880 CHARLESTON AFB/INTERNATIC SC 722106-WB 12835 PAGE FIELD AIRPORT FL 722110-WB 12842 TAMPA INTERNATIONAL AIRPOLE	GAITHERSBURG MONTGOMERY COUNT Data Available From Data Available To	tone Hancock Emmitaburg 20 N Berkeley Hagerstown Thurmon 21 22 Elkton
722135-WB 13870 ALMA/BACON CO. GA 722137-WB 13878 MALCOLM MC KINNON AIRPORT GA	01/01/1964 V 08/01/2019 V Import New Preloaded Stations	Paw Paw 527 Hedgesville Of Cockeysville Abindon
722140-WB 93805 TALLAHASSEE REGIONAL AIRP( FL 722146-WB 12816 GAINESVILLE RGNL FL 722148-WB 63824 STANLEY COUNTY AIRPORT NC	Comment on Station Station Created on 2019-11-19 Available Data From 2015/02/24 To 2015/11/21	Inwood Hamere Ferry
722160-WB 13869 SW GEORGIA REGIONAL ARPT GA 722166-WB 93845 VALDOSTA REGIONAL AIRPORT GA 722170-WB 03813 MIDDLE GEORGIA REGIONAL AI GA	Manage Station Precipitation Data	Capon Bridge Charles Town Baltimore Charles Town Charles
722177-WB 63811 ANDREWS-MURPHY AIRPORT NC 722180-WB 03820 AUGUSTA REGIONAL AT BUSH I GA	Manage Station Solar Data	ville  Stephens City  Middlerown  Middlerown  Stephens City  Stephens City Stephens City  Stephens City  Stephe
P NCDC Station Locator	93764	Strasburg Middleburg Reston Cap Pollege Park Sovie (35 Annapolis 201) Toms Brook Front Royal (5) (1) (1) (1) (1) (1) (1) (1) (1) (1) (1
Import Station Header Information 🛪	12U334	Poddstock (20) (2) Fairfax Alexandria (2) Upper Marboro Kavboard shortosts Mad das 5002 3 Goode Terms o

#### https://resourceprotectiongroup.org/wetbud/

#### Wetbud was developed for mitigation wetland design

### Acknowledgment Slide

We thank the many partners who support the Restoration Research program for their funding and interest. Major funding for this phase of the work was provided by the U.S. Environmental Protection Agency. We also thank the US Geological Survey and Montgomery County for sharing data and their personal observations of Tributary 109.



# What are the take home points? What does this mean for me?

TRANSLATION SLIDES BY [INSERT POOLED MONITORING ADVISORY COMMITTEE MEMBER NAME HERE]

### What does this mean for me?

PMAC member add take-home points of the presentation

#### What does this mean for me?

What do I take from this if I am a practitioner:

PMAC member add ~2 ideas here

What do I take from this if I am a regulator:

PMAC member add ~2 ideas here

#### You are done!

Thank you for your hard work to do the research, communicate it clearly to the audience, and translate this into something the audience can do with the information in their work tasks.

#### SWMM model development

- 1. Watershed characteristics and stormwater infrastructure attributes entered into models
- 2. Models calibrated based on observed USGS flow data
- Calibrated models used to explore
   4 stormwater management and 64 climate
   change scenarios
- 4. SWMM-modeled stream discharge used as input to HEC-RAS model





#### HEC-RAS quasi-unsteady, 1-D model development

- 1. Lidar data and measured cross sections used to create channel geometry
- 2. Bed particle counts, bulk sediment samples, and USGS suspended sediment data (Fairfax, VA) used to parameterize sediment transport routines
- 3. Calibrated HEC-RAS to USGS stage data and measured cross section change
- 4. Modeled channel response to stormwater scenarios and climate change scenarios using SWMM output
- 5. Evaluated effectiveness of alternative stormwater management design techniques to protect channel stability



